

Orero, P. (2005). Bogucki, Łukasz (2004) A Relevance Framework for Constraints on Cinema Subtitling.. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 4, 69.

<https://doi.org/10.26034/cm.jostrans.2005.785>

This article is publish under a *Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International* (CC BY):
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>



© Pilar Orero, 2005

Bogucki, Łukasz (2004): *A Relevance Framework for Constraints on Cinema Subtitling*. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu: Łódź, pp. 185. ISBN 83-7171-814-4. zł 18.

The book presents an interesting approach to translation in general, and audiovisual translation in particular. It focuses in the audiovisual translation mode of subtitling, and more pertinently its constraints, and the language and material is from Poland – a perspective little known up to now, but for the classic stereotyped comment that in Poland films were translated by one person reading a voice-over. Though no new light is shed on the theoretical chapters on: the nature of translation and its possible theoretical approaches, it is interesting to read that technical constraints have also been taken into consideration, along with the traditional constraints.

The book, which is a full version of the article published in *The Journal of Specialised Translation* 2004: 69-85

<http://www.jostrans.org/issue01/articles/boguckien.htm> has two features which are very attractive: one is the constant quoting and consideration of academics little known in the international academic arena because they do not publish in English: their questions on AVT are most interesting, such as Pienkos (1993: 137-8) who considers "If translation is to be seen as a process of linguistic decoding whereby the source text's syntax and semantics are completely transposed onto the target language, then it becomes clear that there is no way for screen translating to be considered an instance of translation proper." This leads Bogucki to consider AVT in general, and subtitling in particular, as a "communicative transaction" (p. 35) or "adaptation", using Vinay and Darbelnet's terminology. The other interesting approach is the focus on Poland. Most of subtitling literature concentrates in the traditional subtitling countries, and little on those who as Poland prefer the audiovisual translation mode of voice-over, as the author mentions: "According to recent research (a poll by Inst. SMG KRC Poland, 2002) 50.2% of Poles prefer voice-over and 43.4% opt for dubbing; subtitling has only 8.1% supporters. A staggering 72.1% of Poles, when asked which type of AVT was the worst, chose subtitling".

The book achieves not only the analysis of Gutt's Relevance Theory applied to audiovisual translation, using the subtitles of *The Lord of the Rings: The Fellowship of the Ring* – which are relatively new – but it demonstrates how an approach which defines classification and a taxonomy and claims independence can be one of the theoretical foundations in a discussion which leads to a new taxonomy on subtitling procedures.

Pilar Orero
Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona
Pilar.orero@uab.es